Defining Democracy

Concepts and Measures
Recent Trends in Democratization
Core Questions

1. How can democracy be conceptualized?
2. How can we measure democratization?
3. Is the Freedom House measure comprehensive, balanced, and accurate?

Role Playing Exercise
1. Classical Theories

Types of Democracy

- Decisions by all Citizens
  - Jean Jacques Rousseau

- Accountable leaders
  - John Stuart Mill
  - James Madison
  - John Locke

- Competition between elites
  - Joseph Schumpeter
  - Robert Dahl

Pluralist
i. Direct Democracy

- Citizenship rights and duties
- Active engagement all citizens
- Equal expertise all citizens
- Majority rule not minority rights
- Institutions such as
  - referendums, initiatives, workers boards, town meetings, planning consultation, local participation/decision-making.
ii. Liberal Democracy

- Classical 18th C. liberal tradition
- Government restraint [negative freedom]
- Individualism and rational self-interest
- Social contract [Locke, Hobbes]
- Utilitarianism [Bentham, Mill]
- Representative government
  - Core institutions: Elections, universal citizenship, civil liberties, and political rights
iii. Plural democracy

- Post-war era Schumpeter, Dahl, Polsby
- Emphasis on competition between elites
- Representation via competing groups and parties
- Community power studies 1960s
Definition of Representative Democracy

- “Meaningful and extensive competition among individuals and groups (especially parties) for all portions of government power, at regular intervals..."
- A highly inclusive level of political participation in the selection of leaders and policies, at least through regular and fair elections, such that no major (adult) social group is excluded.
- A level of civil and political liberties - freedom of expression, freedom of the press, freedom to form and join organizations...
Socialist v. Liberal Models?

- What rights count?
- Dieter Fuchs: E. & W. Germany
- Persistent differences in priority given to freedom or equality
- Implications for definition of democratic rights eg right to expression, right to work, right to childcare?
2. Measurement

- Freedom House
  - Annual Index of Political Rights and Civil Liberties
- Scale from 1 (most free) to 7 (least free).
- Nations worldwide classified as...
  - Free (1 to 2.5) (established democracies)
  - Partly free (3 to 5.5) (consolidating)
  - Not free (5.5 to 7) (non-democracies)
F.H. Checklist of Political Rights

1. Is the head of state and/or head of government elected through free and fair elections?
2. Are the legislative representatives elected through free and fair elections?
3. Are there fair electoral laws, equal campaigning opportunities, fair polling, and honest tabulation of ballots?
4. Are the voters able to endow their freely elected representatives with real power?
5. Do the people have the right to organize in different political parties and is the system open to the rise and fall of these competing parties or groupings?
6. Is there a significant opposition vote, de facto opposition power, and a realistic possibility for the opposition to increase its support or gain power through elections?
7. Are the people free from domination by the military, foreign powers, totalitarian parties, religious hierarchies, economic oligarchies, or any other powerful group?
8. Do cultural, ethnic, religious, and other minority groups have reasonable self-determination, self-government, autonomy, or participation through informal consensus in the decision-making process?
F.H. Checklist of Civil Liberties

1. Are there free and independent media?
2. Are there free religious institutions and is there free private and public religious expression?
3. Is there freedom of assembly, demonstration, and open public discussion?
4. Is there freedom of political or quasi-political organization?
5. Are there free trade unions and peasant organizations or equivalents? Are there free professional and other private organizations?
6. Is there an independent judiciary?
7. Does the rule of law prevail in civil and criminal matters? Is the population treated equally under the law? Are police under direct civilian control?
8. Is there protection from political terror? Is there freedom from war and insurgencies?
9. Is there freedom from extreme government indifference and corruption?
10. Is there open and free private discussion?
11. Is there personal autonomy? Does the state control travel, choice of residence, or choice of employment? Is there freedom from indoctrination and excessive dependency on the state?
12. Are property rights secure? Do citizens have the right to establish private businesses?
13. Are there personal social freedoms, including gender equality, choice of marriage partners, and size of family?
14. Is there equality of opportunity?
3. Evaluation

How would you evaluate the Freedom House checklists?

- Comprehensive?
- Balanced?
- Accurate?
- Pros and cons of this measure?
Role playing exercise

- Divide into pairs from different countries...
- One of you has been appointed as a consultant by Amnesty International to conduct an evaluation of a country. You need to interview the other person who provides information as a country expert.
- Using the Freedom House checklist, what is your democratic rating of the country?
- Swap roles as consultant and expert
- What are the problems encountered by this exercise?
- Are your ratings similar, or different, to those by FH?
Conclusions

- Alternative conceptions of democracy provide different measures. No definition can be value-neutral.
- The Freedom House index provides one common measure of representative democracy. Pros and cons.
- Next class: understanding longer-term trends and regional patterns.